

A Trio of Templates Compared

Framing Citations of the 1930 US Census with RootsMagic 5 Free Form, Standard and Custom Source Templates

Summary

By comparing citations of the same source produced using a range of source templates in RootsMagic 5 genealogy software, this report shows that RootsMagic 5's Source Templates feature is buggy and incomplete and advocates use of a modified *Free Form* template to avoid problems.

Contents

Summary	1
Introduction	2
1930 US Census – Ancestry.com Source Information.....	2
Sufficiency, Style, Lumping and Splitting	3
Fitting the Source Information into the Template Framework	3
!MyFreeForm3 – A Better Free Form Source Template.....	3
Simplified Citations – Census – custom template by Jeff La Marca	5
Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images) – a RootsMagic Standard Template	6
Results.....	7
RootsMagic 5 Edit Source Preview	7
!MyFreeForm3.....	7
Simplified Citations – Census	7
Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images).....	8
RootsMagic 5 Reports	9
Endnotes	9
Bibliography	10
Websites.....	11
GEDCOM	12
GEDCOM Imported into Other Software	13
Personal Ancestral File 5	13
Conclusions and Recommendations	14

Introduction

This study compares the usage and results of citing the same source using three different templates:

- *!MyFreeForm3* – A Better Free Form Source Template (differences with the built-in Free Form template are described)
- *Simplified Citations – Census* – custom template by Jeff La Marca
- *Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images)* – a RootsMagic Standard Template

The results that we should look at are:

- RootsMagic's own outputs:
 - Report Footnotes/Endnotes and Bibliography
 - Website citations
 - Standard GEDCOM
- Output from third-party software having imported the RM export

1930 US Census – Ancestry.com Source Information

Suppose we found our source for J.H. Robertson on Ancestry.com. Here is what the website suggests as information for the citation:

Record Index	Source Information
Name: J H Robertson Age: 33 Birth Year: abt 1897 Birthplace: Canada Home in 1930: Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey View Map House Number: 416 Street Address: Rutherford Avenue Race: White Relation to Head of House: Head Spouse's Name: Clara Robertson Father's Birthplace: Scotland Mother's Birthplace: Ontario, Canada Line Number: 98	Record URL: http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?h=5323321&db=1930usfedcen&indiv=try Source Citation: Year: 1930; Census Place: <i>Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey</i> ; Roll: 1384; Page: 18; Enumeration District: 9; Image: 732.0. Source Information:  Ancestry.com. 1930 United States Federal Census [database online]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. <i>Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930</i> . Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.

Sufficiency, Style, Lumping and Splitting

Now I think the Ancestry Source Information, Source Citation and Record URL taken together is comprehensive and, by and large, complies with the principles of *Evidence Explained* for content, even though it is not necessarily in a pattern corresponding to any one of the built-in source templates or either of the custom templates tried in this report. There is sufficient information for someone else to be able to find the source data and image. The challenge is to fit this information into each source template in such a way that the various outputs from RootsMagic are sensible and usable.

We do have to make a decision on what information goes into the Master Source and what goes into Source Details—are you a “lumper” or a “splitter”? If a lumper, you are likely wanting the Master Source to be the *1930 US Census*; if a splitter, maybe you want it to be *1930 US Census, New Jersey, Sussex County*. That will determine which pieces go into the Master Source fields. Conversely, your choice of template may dictate the division, as we will see below.

Fitting the Source Information into the Template Framework

!MyFreeForm3 – A Better Free Form Source Template

In this example, I chose to be a lumper and that nicely corresponds with how Ancestry.com divides the information. Their *Source Information* will go into RM’s Master Source while their *Source Citation* fits into Source Details. One virtue of a free form template (i.e., one with few fields and no embedded text in the sentence template) is that we don’t have to juggle many different pieces and their order is comparatively flexible.

Here is how I parsed the Ancestry information into my citation, adding the date it was accessed and the item of interest:

Master Source	Cens: 1930 US - Ancestry.com (mff3)
Footnote	Ancestry.com. <i>1930 United States Federal Census</i> [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002
Punctuation	
Short Footnote	1930 US Census
Bibliography	Ancestry.com. <i>1930 United States Federal Census</i> [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. <i>Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930</i>. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.
Source Details	
Details	http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?db=1930usfedcen&h=5323321&ti=0&indiv=try&gss=pt , accessed 17 Oct 2011; Year: 1930; Census Place: Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; Roll 1384; Page: 1B; Enumeration District: 9; Image: 732.0
Key	household of J. H. Robertson.

I chose to put the information about the Original data in the Bibliography, rather than in the Footnote field because it makes the printed footnote very wordy and can be considered common knowledge. For other lesser known data sources, it would be advisable to keep it in the Footnote field because Bibliography does not export to a standard GEDCOM.

To restore italics, I had to insert HTML tags in the values pasted from Ancestry.

Simplified Citations – Census – custom template by Jeff La Marca

This template is one of three developed by Jeff La Marca from a common master template with the objective of unifying the hundreds of built-in source templates to a very few that might suit a wide range of sources, while exploiting the properties of field types (Date, Place,...). More background is available on the RootsMagic Forums in this [thread](#), among others. It was downloaded from Renee Zamora's [website](#).

Based on the hints provided for each field, here is how I parsed the information from Ancestry.com, from its suggested citation, its index information, and from the image itself:

Master Source	Cens: 1930 US - Ancestry.com (Simplified-Census)
Primary Creator	United States of America
Dept. or Office	Bureau of the Census
Date	1930
Source Description	<i>Fifteenth Census of the United States</i>
Person(s) of Interest	household of J.H. Robertson
Publisher	Ancestry.com. <i>1930 United States Federal Census</i> [database on-line]: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002
Publish. Location	Provo, UT, USA
Source Details	
Page Number(s)	Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98
Person	J.H. Robertson
Location	Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey
Census Enum. Dist.	9
Census House. ID	416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26
Repository	Ancestry.com, Original data: National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C.
URL	http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?h=5323321&db=1930usfedcen&indiv=try
Date File Accessed	17 October 2011
Misc. Ref. Num.	MiscRefNum
Personal ID	your catalog ID

I had difficulty with the way the footnote and bibliography sentences were coming out as I tried to follow the hints as closely as possible and, yet, incorporate all the vital information. The division between Master and Detail is unacceptable without modification of the template: I could make the Short Footnote work at the expense of the Footnote and the Bibliography, or vice-versa, as we will see in the results.

Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images) – a RootsMagic Standard Template

Because an image of the source must be considered to be closer to the source than an index, I chose this built-in template over the obvious alternative, *Census, U.S. Federal (Database/Index)*.

Again, using the hints as guidance, here is how I parsed the Ancestry.com provided information, from its suggested citation, its index information, and from the image itself:

Master Source	Cens: 1930 US - Ancestry.com (Census, US Fed - Online images)
Country (optional)	United States of America
Year and type	1930 US Census
Jurisdiction	Sussex Co., New Jersey Sussex, NJ
Schedule	population schedule pop. sched.
Item type	
Website	Ancestry.com
URL	http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224
Credit line	Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. <i>Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930</i>. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls
Source Details	
Civil Division	Franklin Township
Enumeration District	9
Page ID	Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98
Census Enum. Dist.	9
Household ID	416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26
Person of interest	household of J.H. Robertson
Access type	
Access date	17 October 2011

Without modification, this template invites splitting of a census into many sources, because Jurisdiction is in the Master Source. One could leave Jurisdiction blank and place the data in Civil Division, in order to lump; alternatively, make a copy of the template and edit it to move Jurisdiction to the top of the Source Details.

Results

RootsMagic 5 Edit Source Preview

!MyFreeForm3

Footnote:

Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002, <http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?db=1930usfedcen&h=5323321&ti=0&indiv=try&gss=pt> , accessed 17 Oct 2011; Year: 1930; Census Place: Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; Roll 1384; Page: 1B; Enumeration District: 9; Image: 732.0; household of J. H. Robertson.

Short Footnote:

1930 US Census, household of J. H. Robertson.

Bibliography:

Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. *Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930*. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.

Had we used the built-in Free Form template, the Footnote and Bibliography would be the same but the Short Footnote would be:

Short Footnote:

1930 US Census, <http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?db=1930usfedcen&h=5323321&ti=0&indiv=try&gss=pt>, accessed 17 Oct 2011; Year: 1930; Census Place: Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; Roll 1384; Page: 1B; Enumeration District: 9; Image: 732.0; household of J. H. Robertson.

Simplified Citations - Census

Footnote:

United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). *Fifteenth Census of the United States*: household of J.H. Robertson. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. || Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98. J.H. Robertson. Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; enumeration district 9, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26. Ancestry.com, Original data: National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C. (<http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?h=5323321&db=1930usfedcen&indiv=try>: accessed 17 October 2011). MiscRefNum.

Short Footnote:

United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). *Fifteenth Census of the United States*: household of J.H. Robertson.

Bibliography:

United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). *Fifteenth Census of the United States*: household of J.H. Robertson. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. || Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98. J.H. Robertson. Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; enumeration district 9, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26. Ancestry.com, Original data: National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C. (<http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?h=5323321&db=1930usfedcen&indiv=try>: accessed 17 October 2011). MiscRefNum.

Without an entry in the Person(s) of Interest field, the Short Footnote provides no direction to finding the first Footnote printed, if the 1930 Census is cited for different people, but that field is in the Master

Source thus forcing a unique Master Source for every household! That is splitting in the extreme! If, instead, the unique value for the Short Footnote came from the Person field in the Source Details, Person(s) of Interest could be empty and the 1930 US Census would be a single (lumped) Master Source.

The Bibliography is probably unacceptable to most – there will be one entry for every citation of a different household, regardless of the use of the Person(s) of Interest field, because Source Details fields are used in the Bibliography sentence. As it is, the Bibliography is mere repetition of the Footnote.

Less of a problem but caught by Word is the extra space character in front of “Bureau”, in all three sentences.

Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images)

Footnote:

1930 US Census, Sussex Co., New Jersey, population schedule, Franklin Township, enumeration district (ED) 9, Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26, household of J.H. Robertson; digital images, *Ancestry.com* (<http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224> : accessed 17 October 2011); Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. *Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930*. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.

Short Footnote:

1930 US Census, Sussex, NJ, pop. sched., Franklin Township, ED 9, Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26, household of J.H. Robertson.

Bibliography:

United States of America. New Jersey. Sussex Co. 1930 US Census, population schedule. Digital images. *Ancestry.com*. <http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224> : 2011.

Placing “Sussex Co., New Jersey | |Sussex, NJ” in Jurisdiction has the effect of splitting the census at the county level, viz. the Bibliography. This can be readily lumped by leaving Jurisdiction empty and entering in Civil Division: “Franklin Township, Sussex Co., New Jersey | |Franklin, Sussex, NJ”, resulting in:

Footnote:

1930 US Census, , population schedule, Franklin Township, Sussex Co., New Jersey, enumeration district (ED) 9, Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26, household of J.H. Robertson; digital images, *Ancestry.com* (<http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224> : accessed 17 October 2011); Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. *Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930*. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.

Short Footnote:

1930 US Census, , pop. sched., Franklin, Sussex, NJ, ED 9, Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26, household of J.H. Robertson.

Bibliography:

United States of America. . 1930 US Census, population schedule. Digital images. *Ancestry.com*. <http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224> : 2011.

Unfortunately, leaving Jurisdiction blank results in extraneous punctuation bracketing where its value would ordinarily be. This can be fixed only in a copy of the template as built-in templates are not editable.

RootsMagic 5 Reports

These outputs should correspond with those of Edit Source preview or else there would be a bug; they appear to be identical. Reproducing them in a cluster here helps with the comparison of the results from the three templates.

Endnotes

The following endnotes 7, 8, 9 are the first or long footnotes from each of the three templates followed by their corresponding Short Footnotes 10, 11, 12.

7, 10: *!MyFreeForm3*

8, 11: *Simplified Citations – Census*

9, 12: *Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images)*

7. Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002, <http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?db=1930usfedcen&h=5323321&ti=0&indiv=try&gss=pt> , accessed 17 Oct 2011; Year: 1930; Census Place: Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; Roll 1384; Page: 1B; Enumeration District: 9; Image: 732.0; household of J. H. Robertson.

8. United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). *Fifteenth Census of the United States*: household of J.H. Robertson. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. || Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98. J.H. Robertson. Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; enumeration district 9, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26. Ancestry.com, Original data: National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C. (<http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?h=5323321&db=1930usfedcen&indiv=try>: accessed 17 October 2011). MiscRefNum.

9. 1930 US Census, , population schedule, Franklin Township, Sussex Co., New Jersey, enumeration district (ED) 9, Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26, household of J.H. Robertson; digital images, *Ancestry.com* (<http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224> : accessed 17 October 2011); Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. *Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930*. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.

10. 1930 US Census, household of J. H. Robertson.

11. United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). *Fifteenth Census of the United States*: household of J.H. Robertson.

12. 1930 US Census, , pop. sched., Franklin, Sussex, NJ, ED 9, Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26, household of J.H. Robertson.

I think the built-in template and *Simplified Citations* do a good job of tying back the Short Footnote to the Footnote because both footnotes start with the same phrase; the *!MyFreeForm3* version could easily be revised to have the same leading phrase in both footnotes at the expense of added wordiness in the Short Footnote or loss of the proper database name in the first footnote by substituting the short paraphrase.

On the other hand, I think *!MyFreeForm3* does better than the others in linking back from Short Footnote because its ending phrase matches the ending phrase of the full footnote and is the key that distinguishes this citation from others of the same census. For the others, the key information is lost in the middle of the footnote.

For scanning by eye, start-start and end-end matchup is an advantage.

The URL is considerably shorter in the *Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images)* template because it is located in the Master Source. So it was not possible to use the URL supplied by Ancestry.com in its Source Information page as that is a search to a specific person on a specific page. Instead, I had to navigate up a path I had not followed to find the search page for the particular Jurisdiction in the 1930 Census database.

Bibliography

Here are the printed Bibliography sentences from each template, following the same order as above.

Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. *Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930*. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.

United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). *Fifteenth Census of the United States*: household of J.H. Robertson. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. || Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98. J.H. Robertson. Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; enumeration district 9, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26. Ancestry.com, Original data: National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C. (<http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?h=5323321&db=1930usfedcen&indiv=try>; accessed 17 October 2011). MiscRefNum.

United States of America. . 1930 US Census, population schedule. Digital images. Ancestry.com. <http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224> : 2011.

The *Simplified Citations* – *Census* output is clearly distinguished in the middle of the group as being inappropriate, being identical to the footnote and resulting in one Bibliography entry per unique citation. The other two are clearly a single entry for all citations of the same database of the 1930 US Census.

Of the two, while both are probably acceptable, setting aside the extraneous punctuation, I think the first looks better and is more rigorous in showing the actual title of the database and location of the publisher. And the Bibliography seems to be the right place for the Credit line, not the footnote, for a popular and well-known database. Advantage: *!MyFreeForm3*.

Websites

A *Family groups sheet* type website was generated using the “Include sources as endnotes” option, producing the following:

1. Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002, <http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?db=1930usfedcen&h=5323321&ti=0&indiv=try&gss=pt> , accessed 17 Oct 2011; Year: 1930; Census Place: Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; Roll 1384; Page: 1B; Enumeration District: 9; Image: 732.0; household of J. H. Robertson.
2. United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). *Fifteenth Census of the United States*: household of J.H. Robertson. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census*[database on-line]: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. || Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98. J.H. Robertson. Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; enumeration district 9, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26. Ancestry.com, Original data: National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C. (<http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?h=5323321&db=1930usfedcen&indiv=try>: accessed 17 October 2011). MiscRefNum.
3. 1930 US Census, , population schedule, Franklin Township, Sussex Co., New Jersey, enumeration district (ED) 9, Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98, 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26, household of J.H. Robertson; digital images, *Ancestry.com* (<http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224> : accessed 17 October 2011); Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. *Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930*. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.

These appear to be identical to the Edit Source preview and report endnotes but no short footnote was produced. Presumably the option to NOT re-use endnote numbers that is provided in Print reports is unavailable for websites.

The same site was regenerated using the “Include sources as bibliography” option:

Sources

- Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census* [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. *Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930*. Washington, D.C.: National Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.
- United States of America. . 1930 US Census, population schedule. Digital images. Ancestry.com. <http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224> : [AccessDate:Year].
- United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). *Fifteenth Census of the United States*: household of J.H. Robertson. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com. *1930 United States Federal Census*[database on-line]: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. || [Page]. [SourceDetailPerson]. [Location]; enumeration district [CensusED], [HouseholdID]. [Repository:Caps] ([URL]: accessed [Accessed]). [RefNumber:Caps].

Both *Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images)* and *Simplified Citations – Census* (order reversed from all previous outputs!) are unacceptable, having just field names from the Source Details fields that are inexplicably included in the Bibliography sentence. Both had values in the printed reports.

While that may be a bug that will eventually be squashed, only *!MyFreeForm3* currently outputs exactly the same bibliography on-line as it does in printed reports. Advantage: *!MyFreeForm3*.

GEDCOM

A plain vanilla GEDCOM was exported containing the test family. In each set, the block containing the PAGE tag contains the Source Details while the block containing the TITL tag contains the Master Source information.

```

                                !MyFreeForm3
2 SOUR @S62@
3 PAGE http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-
bin/sse.dll?db=1930usfedcen&h=5323321&ti=0&indiv=try&gss=pt , accessed 17 Oct 2011; Year: 1930;
Census Place: Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; Roll 1384; Page: 1B; Enumeration District: 9;
Image: 732.0; household of J. H. Robertson.
...
0 @S62@ SOUR
1 ABBR Cens: 1930 US - Ancestry.com (mff3)
1 TITL Ancestry.com. <i>1930 United States Federal Census</i> [database on-lin
2 CONC e]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002

                                Simplified Citations - Census
2 SOUR @S148@
3 PAGE Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98; J.H. Robertson; Franklin, Sussex, New
Jersey; 9; 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26; Ancestry.com, Original data: National
Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C.; http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-
bin/sse.dll?h=5323321&db=1930usfedcen&indiv=try ; 17 October 2011; MiscRefNum; your catalog ID
...
0 @S148@ SOUR
1 ABBR Cens: 1930 US - Ancestry.com (Simplified-Census)
1 TITL United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). <i>Fifteenth Ce
2 CONC nsus of the United States</i>: household of J.H. Robertson. Provo, UT, U
2 CONC SA: Ancestry.com. <i>1930 United States Federal Census</i> [database on
2 CONC -line]: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002. ||

                                Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images)
2 SOUR @S149@
3 PAGE Franklin Township, Sussex Co., New Jersey||Franklin, Sussex, NJ; 9; Roll: 1384; Page:
1B; Image: 732.0; line 98; 416 Rutherford Ave., dwelling 26, family 26; household of J.H.
Robertson; 17 October 2011
...
0 @S149@ SOUR
1 ABBR Cens: 1930 US - Ancestry.com (Census, US Fed - Online images)
1 TITL 1930 US Census, , population schedule, , ; digital images, <i>Ancestry.
2 CONC com</i> (http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6224 : accessed )
2 CONC ; Original data: United States of America, Bureau of the Census. <i>Fif
2 CONC teenth Census of the United States, 1930</i>. Washington, D.C.: Nationa
2 CONC l Archives and Records Administration, 1930. T626, 2,667 rolls.
```

Each one appears to be a complete footnote. Neither Short Footnote nor Bibliography is supported by standard GEDCOM. Both the HTML italics tags that are embedded in the built-in source template sentence and those entered manually within field values are exported. What is done with those depends on the receiving software.

Likewise, the built-in template exports the “|” string that separates a long value and an abbreviated value in the same field; while that is recognised in RootsMagic, it does not necessarily mean anything other than two printable characters in other software.

Both non Free Form style templates citations are degraded on export. *Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images)* gains more extraneous punctuation while “accessed” and its date become separated. *Simplified Citations – Census* gains another field value that should not be part of the citation – its Personal ID, i.e., “your personal Library Document ID number”. Both lose the “enumeration district” phrase leaving just the number 9.

On the other hand, the *!MyFreeForm3* citation appears intact. Having placed the Credit line in the Bibliography results in its loss on export – easily corrected by incorporating it in the Footnote field.

Advantage: *!MyFreeForm3*.

GEDCOM Imported into Other Software

The only GEDCOM compatible software in my possession is PAF. This section may expand if I gain access to others.

Personal Ancestral File 5

I imported the GEDCOM into PAF 5.2.18.0 with many error messages, some having to do with unrecognised fact types, but those having direct bearing on sources that were imported were truncation messages. Here is the set of footnotes from PAF:

6. Ancestry.com. 1930 United States Federal Census [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations Inc, 2002, <http://search.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/sse.dll?db=1930usfedcen&h=5323321&ti=0&indiv=try&gss=pt> .
7. United States of America, Bureau of the Census (1930). Fifteenth Census of the United States: household of J.H. Robertso, Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; Image: 732.0; line 98; J.H. Robertson; Franklin, Sussex, New Jersey; .
8. 1930 US Census, , population schedule, , ; digital images, Ancestry.com
(<http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6>, Franklin Township, Sussex Co., New Jersey||Franklin, Sussex, NJ; 9; Roll: 1384; Page: 1B; I.

None of them are complete. PAF truncated (probably at 80 characters) both the TITL and PAGE values. It stripped the HTML tags. In order to be compatible with PAF, the RootsMagic sources would have to be kept very succinct. That is most easily done and controlled using Free Form – the text for the Footnote field (what goes to TITL) can be prepared in a text editor with character count to stay below 80 and likewise for the one or two total fields used in Source Details (what goes to PAGE).

A disappointing outcome all around but Advantage: *Free Form*, slightly ahead of *!MyFreeForm*.

Conclusions and Recommendations

1. Many built-in source templates should be avoided or a copy made and revised if you intend to:
 - a. Use the website tool with the “Include sources as bibliography” option because those having a Source Details field included in the Bibliography sentence template will have that field’s name in square brackets outputted in their sentences in the source list.
 - b. Export to standard GEDCOM because:
 - i. Field values containing a *long form* | *abbreviated form* string are exported completely, instead of exporting just the *long form*
 - ii. Order of embedded text and field values may be disjointed
 - iii. Some key embedded words may be lost, e.g., “enumeration district”
2. The built-in source template *Census, U.S. Federal (Online Images)* should be avoided or a copy made and corrected if it is desired to lump all citations of a given census year under one Master Source by leaving the *Jurisdiction* field blank because it results in extraneous punctuation in all three sentence types. Moreover, the *URL* field is wrongly placed in Master Source if it is to provide a link to the specific person of interest in a database or to the corresponding digital image. By inference, other built-in templates have similar unwanted results.
3. The only one of the three source templates tested that outputted correctly and consistently to all outputs was *!MyFreeForm3* (and, from experience, so too does its parent, *Free Form*).
4. The *Free Form* and *!MyFreeForm3* templates can provide the easiest scanning from Short Footnote to the first Footnote for a source because they can provide a match between both footnotes starting words and their ending words. The other two templates have a more complex relationship between their Short Footnote and first Footnote that is not as easy to find among many footnotes.
5. Exporting to PAF requires constraining the length of the values output to the TITL (Master Source fields) and PAGE (Source Details fields) tags to be limited to 80 characters else they will be truncated by PAF on import. This is most easily managed in a template with the fewest fields and no embedded text, e.g., *Free Form* and *!MyFreeForm3*.
6. The study is silent on the results of GEDCOM exports to third party applications other than PAF.
7. The custom source template *Simplified Citations – Census* (and, by inference, its siblings) should be avoided or extensively revised because:
 - a. Either its Short Footnote is unacceptably vague or it requires a unique source for every person cited, which is excessive in the extreme.
 - b. Its Bibliography sentence is just a repeat of the full Footnote and thus generates a list in the Bibliography section of a report that is equal to the number of unique footnotes from that source, thus splitting a source to the extreme.
 - c. It shares the shortcomings of many built-in source templates in outputs other than RootsMagic reports.
 - d. It exports to a GEDCOM citation a field value that is intended to be for personal use.
8. Use *Free Form* or *!MyFreeForm3* source templates, the latter if you wish to take advantage of its more succinct Short Footnotes, to avoid all the problems of the built-in source templates and

the effort involved in revising copies thereof to mitigate their defects. Use the built-in templates to help draft citations in the freer form versions.

9. RootsMagic still has work to do to fix bugs in its various outputs of sources and to complete its implementation of its Source Templates feature.

Tom Holden

VE3MEO at gmail com

5 January 2012